

## Viability of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in Fermented Semidry Low-Temperature-Cooked Beef Summer Sausage

MEHMET CALICIOGLU,<sup>1</sup> NANCY G. FAITH,<sup>2</sup> DENNIS R. BUEGE,<sup>1</sup> and JOHN B. LUCHANSKY<sup>2,3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Meat Science and Muscle Biology Laboratory, Department of Animal Sciences, <sup>2</sup>Department of Food Microbiology and Toxicology, Food Research Institute, and <sup>3</sup>Department of Food Science, the University of Wisconsin—Madison, Madison, Wisconsin 53706, USA

(MS# 96-317: Received 12 November 1996/Accepted 8 February 1997)

### ABSTRACT

The population of inoculated *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 was monitored during the manufacture and storage of a semidry beef summer sausage processed by fermentation and cooking at a low temperature by heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C). The all-beef batter (11% fat and nonmeat ingredients) was inoculated with the commercial starter culture *Pediococcus acidilactici* HP ( $\geq 8.6$  log CFU/g of batter) and a five-strain mixture of *E. coli* O157:H7 ( $\geq 7$  log CFU/g) and then hand stuffed into 2.5-inch (64-mm) diameter fibrous casings. The sausages were fermented at an initial temperature of 85°F (29°C) to a final temperature of 105°F (41°C) over ca. 13 h at 80% relative humidity (RH) to pH 4.6 or pH 5.0. After fermentation to pH 4.6, the internal temperature of the chubs was raised to 130°F (54°C) instantaneous over 3.6 h at 60% RH. After fermentation to pH 5.0, the internal temperature of the chubs was raised to 130°F (54°C) over 3.6 h at 60% RH and the chubs were maintained under these conditions for 0, 30, or 60 min. The chubs were cold water showered for 15 min and then chilled at 39°F (4°C) for 6 h before being vacuum packaged and stored at 39°F (4°C) or 77°F (25°C) for 7 days. Regardless of the target pH, fermentation alone resulted in only a 1.39-log CFU/g decrease in pathogen numbers. However, fermentation to pH 4.6 and heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) instantaneous reduced counts of *E. coli* O157:H7 by  $\geq 7.0$  log units to below detection levels ( $< 10$  CFU/g). Pathogen numbers remained below levels detectable by direct plating, but viable *E. coli* O157:H7 cells were recovered by enrichment of samples during sausage storage at either refrigeration or abuse temperatures. In contrast, fermentation to pH 5.0 and heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) instantaneous resulted in a 3.2-log-unit decrease in counts of *E. coli* O157:H7. No appreciable reductions in pathogen numbers were observed thereafter following storage at either 39°F (4°C) or 77°F (25°C) for 7 days. Fermentation to pH 5.0 and heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) instantaneous followed by holding for 30 or 60 min resulted in about a 5- or 7-log reduction, respectively, in pathogen numbers. For chubs held for 30 min at 130°F (54°C), pathogen numbers decreased to 2.02 and  $< 1.0$  log CFU/g at 39°F (4°C) and 77°F (25°C), respectively, after 7 days; viable cells were only observed by enrichment after storage at 77°F (25°C). For chubs held for 60 min at 130°F (54°C), pathogen numbers remained below levels detectable by direct plating, but viable cells were recoverable by enrichment after 7

days at both storage temperatures. These data will be useful guidelines to manufacturers for developing processing conditions to further ensure the safety of this category of fermented sausages relative to food-borne pathogens such as serotype O157:H7 strains of *E. coli*.

Key words: *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, beef, summer sausage, pathogen, fermentation

*Escherichia coli* O157:H7 has received considerable attention in the United States in recent years as the causative agent of bacterial food-borne diarrheal illness which has an estimated \$216 to 580 million in attendant annual costs (16). The 1994 outbreak in Washington involving 20 individuals, including a 6-year-old with hemolytic uremic syndrome (HUS), and 3 individuals in California, including a 4-year-old with HUS, due to consumption of dry-cured salami contaminated with *E. coli* O157:H7 (7), was largely responsible for the United States Department of Agriculture Food Safety and Inspection Service mandate for manufacturers of dry and semidry fermented sausage to ensure a 5-log reduction in numbers of this pathogen during processing (20). As a result of the salami outbreak, the 1993 multistate outbreak due to contaminated hamburger patties with  $> 500$  confirmed cases and four deaths (6), and several other illnesses in the 1990s involving foods (14), the following programs and regulations were implemented in the United States to ensure the safety of consumers with respect to food-borne illness due to enterohemorrhagic strains of *E. coli*. The temperature for cooking hamburger patties was raised from 140°F (60°C) to 155°F (68°C) for 16 s (10); safe-handling labels were required for all raw meat and poultry, as well as for partially cooked meats such as bacon (11); a pathogen reduction program was initiated for the meat and poultry industries (12); *E. coli* O157:H7 was declared to be an adulterant when present in ground beef (1); and a ground beef sampling program was instituted at federally inspected processing plants and retail establishments (2).

With the exception of recent studies involving pepperoni (15) and salami (9, 13, 18), relatively little information has been published on the validation of processes for control of *E. coli* O157:H7 directly in fermented meats. These studies of pepperoni and salami confirmed that

\* Author for correspondence. Tel: (608) 262-0555; Fax: (608) 265-3110; E-mail: drbuege@facstaff.wisc.edu



35 min at 150°F (66°C), all at 60% RH. After the internal chub temperature of 130°F (54°C) was attained, the chubs were held at this temperature for 0, 30, or 60 min and then cold water showered for 15 min. After showering, the internal temperatures of the chubs decreased to 93 to 108°F (34 to 42°C) depending on the holding time at 130°F (54°C) in the smokehouse. The chubs were then chilled for 6 h at 39°F (4°C) before being vacuum packaged in oxygen-impermeable bags (863 saran, Curwood, Inc., New London, WI) using a Multivac type AGW (Koch Inc., Kansas City, Missouri) apparatus. Finally, vacuum-packaged chubs were stored at 39°F (4°C) or 77°F (25°C) for 7 days. Both experiments (fermentation to pH 4.6 and to pH 5.0) were conducted on 3 different days using 3 different batches of raw meat (3 trials for each experiment). Samples (25 g) were taken from each of 3 chubs at each sampling interval: before stuffing, after fermentation, after cooking, and after storage and plated onto 2 plates of MacConkey sorbitol agar (MSA) (Difco Laboratories Inc., Detroit, MI) from each of 2 tubes of a given dilution essentially as described (15). For samples containing the pathogens at levels <10<sup>1</sup> CFU/g of batter, the presence or absence of the pathogen was determined by enrichment as described (15).

Chemical analyses were performed by Silliker Laboratories (Madison, WI) by using AOAC-approved methods (17) for pH, titratable acidity, salt, protein, fat, moisture, and a<sub>w</sub> on 2 chubs from each trial after storage for 7 days at 39°F (4°C). Statistical analyses were performed by using Statistical Analysis System software (SAS Institute, Cary, NC) to determine the means of the viable counts of *E. coli* O157:H7 and of the chemical composition parameters of the meat.

## RESULTS

### Microbiological analyses of the raw meat

None of the 6 meat blocks used in this study to prepare batter for summer sausage contained *E. coli* O157:H7 (<10 CFU/g of batter) by direct plating. The mean total aerobic counts and lactic acid bacteria counts of these 6 meat blocks were 1.1 × 10<sup>4</sup> CFU/g (range, 3.8 × 10<sup>3</sup> to 2.7 × 10<sup>4</sup> CFU/g) and 1.5 × 10<sup>3</sup> CFU/g (range, 4.1 × 10<sup>2</sup> to 6.8 × 10<sup>3</sup> CFU/g), respectively. These data indicate meat of good microbiological quality.

### Fermentation at 105°F (41°C) to pH 4.6 and heating

Fermentation to pH 4.6 yielded a 1.39-log-unit reduction of the number of *E. coli* O157:H7 CFU in chubs of summer sausage (Table 1). Subsequent heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) instantaneous reduced patho-

gen numbers to nondetectable levels (<10 CFU/g of batter) as determined by direct plating, but viable cells of *E. coli* O157:H7 were still recovered by enrichment. Cells of this pathogen were also recovered by enrichment after 1 week of storage at 39°F (4°C) or 77°F (25°C). These data revealed that fermentation to pH 4.6 was not sufficient to deliver a 5-D reduction of the pathogen. However, postfermentation heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) provided a ≥7-log-unit reduction of the pathogen (Table 1), without causing any discernible changes in the appearance or composition of the chubs heated to 130°F (54°C) and held for 0 min (Table 2).

### Fermentation at 105°F (41°C) to pH 5.0, heating, and holding

Results from a preliminary trial (data not shown) suggested that *E. coli* O157:H7 in summer sausage fermented to pH 5.0 would not be sufficiently destroyed (i.e., a 5-D reduction) by postfermentation heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) instantaneous. Therefore, after fermentation to pH 5.0, we evaluated the effect of heating the chubs to 130°F (54°C) and then holding the chubs at this temperature for 30 or 60 min on the viability of the serotype O157:H7 cocktail.

Fermentation to pH 5.0 delivered an 0.31-log-unit reduction of the pathogen, and subsequent heating to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) instantaneous decreased the number of *E. coli* O157:H7 CFU an additional 2.89 log units to 4.58 log CFU/g (Table 1). After 1 week of storage at either 39°F (4°C) or 77°F (25°C), no extensive further reduction of the pathogen was observed. However, if after fermentation to pH 5.0 the chubs were heated to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) and then held at this temperature for 30 min, levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 decreased from an initial level of 7.78 to 2.78 log cfu/g. After 1 week of storage at 77°F (25°C), counts of *E. coli* O157:H7 decreased to below detection (<10 CFU/g) by direct plating, but viable cells were recovered by enrichment. Counts of the pathogen remained relatively constant in chubs stored at 39°F (4°C). Similarly, holding the chubs at an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) for 60 min following fermentation to pH 5.0 yielded a ≥7.0-log-unit reduction of the pathogen, but again, viable cells of the pathogen were detectable following enrichment. After 7 days of storage at either 39°F (4°C) or

TABLE 1. Population of inoculated *E. coli* O157:H7 in fermented semidry low-temperature-cooked summer sausage during manufacture

Batter <sup>a</sup>	After fermentation to (pH)	After heating to 130°F (54°C) and holding for (min)	After storage for 7 days at:	
			39°F (4°C)	77°F (25°C)
7.99 ± 0.33	6.60 ± 0.44 (pH 4.6)	(0) <1.0 <sup>b</sup>	<1.0 <sup>b</sup>	<1.0 <sup>b</sup>
7.78 ± 0.43	7.47 ± 0.26 (pH 5.0)	(0) 4.58 ± 0.46	4.74 ± 0.54	4.14 ± 0.65
		(30) 2.78 ± 0.40	2.02 ± 0.83	<1.0 <sup>b</sup>
		(60) <1.0 <sup>b</sup>	<1.0 <sup>b</sup>	<1.0 <sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> The pH of the raw batter was ca. pH 5.84 and ranged from 5.95 to 5.77 over the three trials.

<sup>b</sup> Not detectable by direct plating methods (<10 cfu/g) but detectable by enrichment.

TABLE 2. Comparison of the physicochemical parameters of differently processed semidry low-temperature-cooked summer sausage after 7 days of storage at 4°C

Proce	Sausage physicochemical parameters <sup>a</sup> (mean ± SD, n = 3)							
	pH	TA (%)	M/Pr	a <sub>w</sub>	Salt (%)	Moisture (%)	Protein (%)	Fat (%)
Experiment I <sup>b</sup>	4.53 ± .04	1.90 ± .02	3.16 ± .08	0.94 ± .00	2.45 ± .12	62.98 ± 2.12	19.66 ± .36	11.95 ± 1.08
Experiment II <sup>c</sup>	4.90 ± .09	1.55 ± .18	3.06 ± .04	0.95 ± .00	2.61 ± .05	64.87 ± .83	20.98 ± .19	10.06 ± .35

<sup>a</sup>

<sup>b</sup> Fermentation to pH 4.6 plus heating to 130°F internal temperature instantaneous.

<sup>c</sup> Fermentation to pH 5.0 plus heating to 130°F internal temperature and holding for 60 min.

77°F (25°C), it was only possible to recover the pathogen by enrichment. These data revealed that a 5-D reduction was only achieved if chubs fermented to pH 5.0 were heated to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) and then held for 30 (ca. 5.0-log reduction) or 60 (ca. 7-log reduction) min. As shown in Table 2, heating did not appreciably alter the compositional attributes of the chubs heated to 130°F (54°C) and held for 60 min.

## DISCUSSION

Reports indicate that *E. coli* O157:H7 ranks third behind *Salmonella* and *Campylobacter* species as a leading cause of bacterial food-borne diarrheal cases worldwide (23) and ranks fourth among the most costly food-borne diseases in the United States (16). From a food safety standpoint, this pathogen is of great concern due to the low infectious dose, the potential life-threatening complications of the ensuing disease, and the ability to tolerate relatively low pH (high acid) conditions. There is also concern about potential ambiguities encountered with detection of *E. coli* O157:H7 relative to other coliforms due to its poor growth at ≥42°C, inability to ferment sorbitol, and lack of β-glucuronidase activity (14). The ability to withstand low pH conditions may explain, at least in part, the survival of this pathogen in certain fermented meat products. Prior to the Washington and California salami outbreak of late 1994, fermented meats were generally regarded as safe due to the presence of organic acid(s) and a low pH, as well as the cooking, curing, smoking, drying, vacuum packaging, and/or refrigerated storage such products may receive. Published studies revealed that fermented meats can serve as a vehicle of transmission for O157:H7 strains (22) and that serotype O157:H7 strains of *E. coli* were not appreciably affected (i.e., ≤2-log decrease) by standard fermentation and drying regimens (15, 18). Additional processing steps, such as postfermentation heating, were required to achieve an appreciable reduction in pathogen numbers. For example, Hinkens et al. (15) reported that heating pepperoni chubs to an instantaneous internal temperature of 145°F (63°C) or 128°F (53°C) for 60 min was sufficient to effect a 5-D kill of an *E. coli* O157:H7 cocktail without visibly affecting the texture or appearance of the chubs. However, not all summer sausage, the category of fermented meat evaluated in the present study, is heated to an internal temperature of 145°F (63°C) or 128°F (53°C) for 60 min due to perceived alterations in the texture and/or flavor of the resulting

product (R. Rust, personal communication). More specifically, 22 processors participating in the 1996 product show sponsored by the Wisconsin Association of Meat Processors (WAMP) each entered at least one summer sausage product into the low-temperature-cooked class. This category is delineated by postfermentation heating at internal chub temperatures of ≤135°F (57°C) (24). An informal survey of contributing processors at the WAMP Product Show revealed that most low-temperature-cooked summer sausage chubs were heated to temperatures ranging from 128°F (53°C) to 135°F (57°C). The paucity of information on the fate of enterohemorrhagic *E. coli* in summer sausage in general, the outbreak in Australia due to "uncooked" summer sausage (8), and the identification of summer sausage as a product with a high priority for validation using USDA/FSIS criteria, e.g., high pH, high moisture/protein ratio, and all beef ingredients (21) were the impetus for the present study to evaluate pathogen viability during manufacture and storage of low-temperature-cooked ("uncooked") beef summer sausage.

Several factors, e.g., fermentation temperature and time, casing size, postfermentation heating, pH, and type of organic acid may influence the viability of cells of *E. coli* O157:H7 in fermented sausage. As discussed above, postfermentation heating resulted in a ≥5-log reduction of pathogen numbers (15). As another example, Nickelson et al. (18) demonstrated that the pathogen was reduced to a greater degree in smaller diameter (55 mm; 6.43-log CFU/g decrease) than larger diameter (105 mm; 4.72-log cfu/g decrease) casings when salami was fermented at 90°F (32°C) to pH 4.6 and held at 90°F (32°C) for 6 to 7 days. It is possible that pathogen numbers were reduced to a greater extent in smaller casing chubs due to a higher rate of heat penetration with higher fermentation temperatures in combination with high-acid conditions possibly sensitizing cells of *E. coli* O157:H7 to subsequent stress during manufacture or storage (15, 18). For example, higher [110°F (43°C)] fermentation temperatures typically provided a greater reduction in pathogen numbers than lower [70°F (21°C)] fermentation temperatures for similar manufacturing processes (18). Likewise, extended holding of chubs after fermentation at an elevated temperature was more effective at reducing pathogen numbers than an otherwise similar fermentation at a lower pH (18). In addition to pH, the antimicrobial effects of organic acids may affect the survival of the pathogen in fermented meats, especially at pH levels near the pK<sub>a</sub> of lactic acid. The intrinsic acid tolerance of the pathogen may

also have an impact on survival characteristics; therefore, stationary-phase cells of serotype O157:H7 may survive in greater numbers in fermented meats than log-phase cells (4).

In the present study, we evaluated the viability of a cocktail of serotype O157:H7 strains of *E. coli* in summer sausage manufactured by using conditions that mimic what is practiced by the sausage-processing industry. Fermentation at 105°F (41°C) to pH 4.6 or 5.0 and postfermentation heating of chubs to an internal temperature of 130°F (54°C) for 30 min delivered a >5-log decrease in pathogen numbers. Additional studies are warranted to better quantify the effects of postfermentation heating and holding on product quality, appearance, and composition and to evaluate additional formulations and/or intervention strategies to eliminate this pathogen. In addition to a hazard analysis critical control points program and good manufacturing practices, the data herein provide manufacturers of fermented, semidry, low-temperature-cooked beef summer sausage with time and temperature guidelines for ensuring safety relative to *E. coli* O157:H7.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank Jim Acton (Clemson University), Robert Rust (Iowa State University), and Lawrence Duerwer (USDA, Economic Research Service, Animal Products) for consultations. We also thank Vista International Packaging Inc., F.W. Witt and Company, and Diversitech for contributing materials for this research. This study was sponsored by a grant from the Wisconsin Beef Council and in part the National Cattlemen's Beef Association. Mehmet Calicioglu was supported by a fellowship from the Ministry of National Education of the Turkish Republican Government.

#### REFERENCES

- Anonymous. 1994. Raw ground beef with *E. coli* is adulterated: Taylor. Food Chem. News 36(32):48-49.
- Anonymous. 1994. Microbiologic testing program for *E. coli* O157:H7 in raw ground beef. Notice no. 50-94. United States Department of Agriculture/Food Safety and Inspection Service, Washington, D.C.
- Anonymous. 1995. Code of federal regulations, title 9, 318.10. Office of the Federal Register, Washington, D.C.
- Arnold, K. W., and C. W. Kaspar. 1995. Starvation and stationary-phase-induced acid tolerance in *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 61:2037-2039.
- Buege, D. R., and R. G. Cassens. 1980. Manufacturing summer sausage. Fact sheet no. A3058. University of Wisconsin-Extension/Madison, Madison, WI.
- Centers for Disease Control. 1993. Update: multistate outbreak of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 infections from hamburgers—Western United States 1992-93. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report* 42:258-263.
- Centers for Disease Control. 1995. *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 outbreak linked to commercially distributed dry-cured salami—Washington and California, 1994. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report* 44:157-160.
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. 1995. Community outbreak of hemolytic uremic syndrome attributable to *Escherichia coli* O111:NM—South Australia, 1995. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report* 44:550-551, 557.
- Clavero, M. R. S., and L. R. Beuchat. 1996. Survival of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in broth and processed salami as influenced by pH, water activity, and temperature and suitability of media for its recovery. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 62:2735-2740.
- Federal Register. 1993. Heat processing, cooking and cooling, handling and storage requirements for uncured meat patties. *Fed. Regist.* 58:41138-41152.
- Federal Register. 1993. Mandatory safe handling statements on labeling of raw meat and poultry products. *Fed. Regist.* 59:14528-14540.
- Federal Register. 1996. Pathogen reduction and HACCP. *Fed. Regist.* 61:38806-38989.
- Glass, K. A., J. M. Loeffelholz, J. P. Ford, and M. P. Doyle. 1992. Fate of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 as affected by pH or sodium chloride and in fermented, dry sausage. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 58:2513-2516.
- Griffin, P. M. 1995. *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and other enterohemorrhagic *Escherichia coli*, p. 739-761. In M. J. Blaser, P. D. Smith, J. I. Ravdin, H. B. Greenberg, and R. L. Guerrant (ed.), *Infections of the gastrointestinal tract*. Raven Press, New York.
- Hinkens, J. C., N. G. Faith, T. D. Lorang, P. B. Bailey, D. R. Buege, C. W. Kaspar, and J. B. Luchansky. 1996. Validation of pepperoni processes for control of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. *J. Food Prot.* 59:1260-1266.
- Marks, S., and T. Roberts. 1993. *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 ranks as the fourth most costly foodborne disease. *Food Rev.* 16(3):51-59.
- McNeal, J. E. 1990. Meat and meat products, p. 931-938. In K. Herlich (ed.), *Official methods of analysis*, 15th ed. Association of Official Analytical Chemists, Arlington, VA.
- Nickelson, R., II, C. W. Kaspar, E. A. Johnson, and J. B. Luchansky. 1996. Update on dry fermented sausage *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 validation research. An executive summary update by the Blue Ribbon Task Force of the National Cattlemen's Beef Association with the Food Research Institute, University of Wisconsin—Madison. Research report no. 11-316. National Cattlemen's Beef Association, Chicago, IL.
- Proctor, M. E. 1996. Surveillance for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 infections in Wisconsin, 1993-1995: investigation of three outbreaks. *Wisconsin Epidemiol. Bull.* 17(1):1-4.
- Reed, C. A. 1995. Challenge study—*Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fermented sausage. April 28, 1995. Letter to Plant Managers. U.S. Department of Agriculture, Food Safety and Inspection Service, Washington, D.C.
- Reed, C. A. 1995. Approaches for ensuring the safety of dry and semidry fermented sausage products. August 21, 1995. Letter to Plant Managers. U.S. Department of Agriculture, Food Safety and Inspection Service, Washington, D.C.
- Tilden, J. W., W. Young, A. M. McNamara, C. Custer, B. Boesel, M. A. Labert-Fair, J. Majkowski, D. Vugia, S. B. Werner, J. Hollingsworth, and J. G. Morris. 1996. A new route of transmission for *Escherichia coli*: infection from dry-cured fermented salami. *Am. J. Public Health* 86:1142-1145.
- Wachsmuth, K. 1994. Summary: public health; epidemiology; food safety; laboratory diagnosis, p. 3-5. In M. A. Karmali and A. G. Goglio (ed.), *Recent advances in verocytotoxin-producing Escherichia coli infections*. Elsevier Science B.V., The Netherlands.
- Wisconsin Association of Meat Processors Inc. 1996. Rules for 1996 Wisconsin Association of Meat Processors (WAMP) meat product show. Wisconsin Association of Meat Processors Inc., Lodi, WI.